**LETTERS**

*edited by Jennifer Sils*

### China’s Environmental Civilian Activism

**IN THE POLICY FORUM “CHINA’S ROAD TO SUSTAINABILITY” (2 APRIL, P. 50), J. LIU OVERLOOKS AN important cultural force. China’s worsening environmental conditions have catalyzed a spirit of environmental civilian activism.**

For example, in 2003, a consortium proposed erecting 13 dams on the Nujiang River. China’s environmental nongovernmental organizations and scholars launched a protest campaign through the Internet and newspapers. The critics argued that as reservoirs behind the dams filled up, flooding and landslides would imperil habitats. In response, Premier Wen Jiabao suspended the dam project pending an environmental review in 2004 (1).

The landmark of environmental civilian activism occurred in Xiamen City in 2007. The local government supported construction of a $1.4-billion paraxylene plant near the center of the city. Information about the environmental impact of this project was not made available to the local residents. The people of Xiamen City were outraged when—they learned of the plant’s environmental risks. A phone text message was circulated among Xiamen citizens in late May calling for a “collective walk” (demonstration). On 1 June 2007, more than 1000 citizens gathered in front of the municipal building to protest. The demonstration forced the local government to cancel the largest industrial project in the history of Xiamen (2).

The burgeoning middle class has become the driver of environmental civilian activism. For example, operation of the Likeng trash incinerator in Guangzhou City started in 2005 without any protest, although local farmers worried about health risk (3). In contrast, the proposed Panyu trash incinerator in Guangzhou City in 2009 triggered protests that were led by the middle class (4), who used science-based evidence to openly challenge prevailing notions formulated by the authorities. (In earlier years, standard practice was to obey Beijing-based experts in environmental protection.) In addition, the self-organized middle class forced the local government to open discussion by Internet. By seizing the opportunity for open discussion, the newly empowered locals took to the streets to protest their environmental rights (4).

Recent years have witnessed an impressive growth in environmental protests in China. The number of petitions and mass public protests related to environmental issues has increased by 30% per year in the past few years, although the number of petitions lodged with the Chinese government has dropped (5).

The current environmental civilian activism movements have several common characteristics: (i) They are confined to one specific geographical space. (ii) Their goal is protecting the environment, rather than political rights or commercial interests. (iii) They focus on a specific pollutant, rather than general environmental degradation. The local nature of the movement enables the organization of a large number of citizens with little effort in a very short time. Given more open social and political conditions and the increasing size of the middle class in China, environmental civilian activism will certainly be a key driver in China’s transition to sustainability.

__QIANG WANG__

Qingdao Institute of Bioenergy and Bioprocess Technology, Chinese Academy of Science, Qingdao, 266101, China; Guangzhou Institute of Geochemistry, Chinese Academy of Science, Guangzhou, 510640, China. E-mail: tswangqiang@yahoo.com.cn

**References and Notes**

6. The views expressed in this paper are the author’s own and not necessarily those of QIBEBT-CAS, GIG-CAS.

I thank B. Jong for comments and linguistic support.

### Effects of China’s Economic Growth

**IN A RECENT POLICY FORUM, J. LIU REVIEWED “China’s road to sustainability” (2 April, p. 50). Liu focused on population growth and an increase in the number of households, but he failed to adequately address the most important socioeconomic driver behind environmental degradation in China: rapid economic growth that is not offset by efficiency improvements (1, 2).**

In China, exports and capital investments contribute significantly more to gross domestic product (GDP) than household and government consumption combined (3), and this also holds true for emissions (1, 2). From 2002 to 2005, the production of exports was responsible for 50% of the growth in carbon dioxide emissions and capital formation was responsible for 35%;
household and government consumption contributed 15% (4, 5).

Liu discusses population control and household size, but a more dominant issue in terms of population dynamics is the migration from rural to urban areas (6). From 1990 to 2007, the urban population increased by 292 million, whereas the rural population decreased by 116 million (3). Urban dwellers, even if migrants from rural areas, have a higher income (3) and hence higher energy use and environmental impacts (2, 6).

A key challenge for China is to continue strong economic growth while minimizing environmental impacts. Reductions in emissions per unit of GDP are unlikely to reduce total emissions if economic growth continues (1). China will need to combine aggressive domestic policies with international support to reverse the current growth in coal-dominated energy use and emissions.

**References**


**Risks of Immune System Treatments**

**Comment on “Detection of an Infectious Retrovirus, XMRV, in Blood Cells of Patients with Chronic Fatigue Syndrome”**

**Comment on “Detection of an Infectious Retrovirus, XMRV, in Blood Cells of Patients with Chronic Fatigue Syndrome”**

Andrew Lloyd, Peter White, Simon Wessely, Michael Sharpe, Dedra Buchwald

Lombardi et al. (Reports, 23 October 2009, p. 585) reported a significant association between the human retrovirus XMRV and chronic fatigue syndrome (CFS). However, the cases with CFS and the control subjects in their study are poorly described and unlikely to be representative. Independent replication is a critical first step before accepting the validity of this finding.

Full text at www.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/328/5980/825-b

**Response to Comments on “Detection of an Infectious Retrovirus, XMRV, in Blood Cells of Patients with Chronic Fatigue Syndrome”**

Judy A. Mikovits and Francis W. Ruscetti

We reported the detection of the human gammaretrovirus XMRV in 67% of 101 patients with chronic fatigue syndrome (CFS) and in 3.7% of 218 healthy controls, but we did not claim that XMRV causes CFS. Here, we explain why the criticisms of Sudlow et al., Lloyd et al., and van der Meer et al. regarding the selection of patients and controls in our study are unwarranted.

Full text at www.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/328/5980/825-d
Finally, although the News Focus story comments on problems obtaining insurance approval in the United States, medical funding is a worldwide issue, including in countries with government-funded health services. In addition to patient safety benefits, less toxic regimens also cost any health care system less money, because patients are less likely to suffer complications such as secondary cancers.

RICHARD K. BURT, MARIO ABINU, DOMINIQUE FARGE-BANCEL, ATHANASIOS FASSAS, FALK HIEPE, EVA HAVRDOVÁ, SUSUMU IKEHARA, YVONNE LOH, ALBERTO MARMONT DU HAUT, JOHN SNOWDEN, ATHANASIOS FASSAS, DOMINIQUE FARGE-BANCEL, JULIO C. VOLTARELLI, SHIMON SLAVIN

1Division of Immunotherapy, Department of Medicine, Northwestern University Feinberg School of Medicine, Chicago, IL 60611, USA. 2Department of Pathology, Regeneration Research Center for Intractable Diseases, Center for Cancer Therapy, Kansai Medical University, 10-15 Fumizono-cho, Horiguchi City, Osaka 570-8506, Japan. 3Department of Haematology, HSCT Program, Singapore General Hospital, 169608 Singapore. 4Division of Hematology and Stem Cell Transplantation, Azienda-Ospedaliera Universitaria San Martino, Genoa, Italy. 5University of São Paulo (USP), Hemocentro Regional e Unidade de Transplante de Medula Óssea–HCF-MRP-USP, Rua Tenente Catão Roxo, 2501, CEP 14051-140, Ribeirão Preto, São Paulo, Brazil. 6Sheffield Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust, University of Sheffield, UK. 7The International Center for Cell Therapy and Cancer Immunotherapy (TICI), Weizman Center, Tel Aviv, Israel.

*To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: rrburt@northwestern.edu

Letters: "Climate change and the integrity of science" by P. H. Gleick et al. (7 May, p. 689). Due to an editorial error, the original image was not a photograph but a collage. It was a mistake to have used it. The image (link available at www.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/328/5979/689/DC2) has been replaced in the HTML version and in the online PDF by an unaltered photograph.

Letters (~300 words) discuss material published in Science in the previous 3 months or issues of general interest. They can be submitted through the Web (www.submit2science.org) or by regular mail (1200 New York Ave., NW, Washington, DC 20005, USA). Letters are not acknowledged upon receipt, nor are authors generally consulted before publication. Whether published in full or in part, letters are subject to editing for clarity and space.

CORRECTIONS AND CLARIFICATIONS